GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY
LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO:3605
ANSWERED ON:23.12.2008
IMPACT OF ORGANISED RETAILING ON UNORGANISED RETAIL STORES
Agarwal Shri Dhirendra;Prasad Shri Hari Kewal;Yadav Shri Anirudh Prasad (Sadhu)

Will the Minister of COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Indian Council for Research on International Economy Relations (ICRIER) instituted to make a study on the impact of organised retailing on unorganised retail trade has submitted its report to the Government;

(b) if so, the details thereof and the reaction of the Government thereto;

(c) whether the aforesaid study has made observation on the threat to unorganised retail stores by organised firms as reported in the Mint dated 28 April, 2008; and

(d) if so, the corrective steps taken / proposed to be taken by the Government in this regard?

Answer

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE & INDUSTRY(SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR)

(a) & (b): Yes, Sir. The Report is available on the department's website, www.dipp.gov.in. The findings and recommendations of the Indian Council for Research on International Relations(ICRIER) are at Annex.

(c): In its report, the ICRIER has, based on a sample survey, reported that the rate of closure of unorganised retail shops in gross terms was found to be about 4.2 per cent, while the rate of closure on account of competition from organised retail was 1.7 per cent per annum. The report has stated that, despite the adverse impact, a majority of unorganised retailers are keen to continue in business and compete.

(d): Government is fully aware of the concerns of all stakeholders on the impact of organised retail on small retailers and vendors and fully recognises the need for ensuring that the small retailers are not adversely affected by the growing organised retail.

ANNEX

STATEMENT REFERRED TO IN REPLY TO PARTS (a) & (b) OF THE LOK SABHA UNSTARRED QUESTION NO. 3605 FOR ANSWER ON 23-12-2008

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF ICRIER

The real GDP is expected to grow at 8-10 per cent per annum in the next five years. As a result, the consuming class with annual household incomes above Rs. 90,000 is expected to rise from about 370 million in 2006-07 to 620 million in 2011-12. Consequently, the retail business in India is estimated to grow at 13 per cent annually from US$ 322 billion in 2006-07 to US$ 590 billion in 2011-12. The study shows:

The unorganized retail sector is expected to grow at about 10 per cent per annum with sales rising from US$ 309 billion in 2006-07 to US$ 496 billion in 2011-12.

Given the relatively weak financial state of unorganized retailers, and the physical space constraints on their expansion prospects, this sector alone will not be able to meet the growing demand for retail.

Hence, organized retail which now constitutes a small four per cent of total retail sector is likely to grow at a much faster pace of 45-50 per cent per annum and quadruple its share in total retail trade to 16 per cent by 2011-12.

This represents a positive sum game in which both unorganized and organized retail not only coexist but also grow substantially in size.

The majority of unorganized retailers surveyed in this study, indicated their preference to continue in the business and compete rather than exit.

The Empirical Basis

The study comprised of survey of all segments of the economy that could be affected by the entry of large corporates in the retail business. The findings are based on a survey of 2020 unorganized small retailers across 10 major cities; 1318 consumers shopping at both organized and unorganized retail outlets; 100 intermediaries; and 197 farmers. In addition, a "control sample" survey was done of 805 unorganized retailers who are not in the vicinity of organized retail outlets in four metro cities.

Detailed interviews were also carried out for 12 large manufacturers, 20 small manufacturers and six established modern retailers.

The study contains an extensive review of international retail experience, particularly from the major emerging market economies.

Main Findings

Impact on Unorganized Retailers

Unorganized retailers in the vicinity of organized retailers experienced a decline in their volume of business and profit in the initial years after the entry of large organized retailers.

The adverse impact on sales and profit weakens over time.

There was no evidence of a decline in overall employment in the unorganized sector as a result of the entry of organized retailers.

#There is some decline in employment in the North and West regions which, however, also weakens over time.

The rate of closure of unorganized retail shops in gross terms is found to be 4.2 per cent per annum which is much lower than the international rate of closure of small businesses.

The rate of closure on account of competition from organized retail is lower still at 1.7 per cent per annum.

There is competitive response from traditional retailers through improved business practices and technology upgradation.

A majority of unorganized retailers is keen to stay in the business and compete, while also wanting the next generation to continue likewise.

Small retailers have been extending more credit to attract and retain customers.

#However, only 12 per cent of unorganized retailers have access to institutional credit and 37 per cent felt the need for better access to commercial bank credit.

Most unorganized retailers are committed to remaining independent and barely 10 per cent preferred to become franchisees of organized retailers.

Impact on Consumers

Consumers have definitely gained from organized retail on multiple counts.

#Overall consumer spending has increased with the entry of the organized retail.

#While all income groups saved through organized retail purchases, the survey revealed that lower income consumers saved more. Thus, organized retail is relatively more beneficial to the less well-off consumers.

Proximity is a major comparative advantage of unorganized outlets.

#Unorganized retailers have significant competitive strengths that include consumer goodwill, credit sales, amenability to bargaining, ability to sell loose items, convenient timings, and home delivery.

Impact on Intermediaries

#The study did not find any evidence so far of adverse impact of organized retail on intermediaries.

There is, however, some adverse impact on turnover and profit of intermediaries dealing in products such as, fruit, vegetables, and apparel.

Over two-thirds of the intermediaries plan to expand their businesses in response to increased business opportunities opened by the expansion of retail.

Only 22 per cent do not want the next generation to enter the same business.

Impact on Farmers

Farmers benefit significantly from the option of direct sales to organized retailers.

Average price realization for cauliflower farmers selling directly to organized retail is about 25 per cent higher than their proceeds

from sale to regulated government mandi.

#Profit realization for farmers selling directly to organized retailers is about 60 per cent higher than that received from selling in the mandi

The difference is even larger when the amount charged by the commission agent (usually 10 per cent of sale price) in the mandi is taken into account.

Impact on Manufacturers

#Large manufacturers have started feeling the competitive impact of organized retail through price and payment pressures.

Manufacturers have responded through building and reinforcing their brand strength, increasing their own retail presence, 'adopting' small retailers, and setting up dedicated teams to deal with modern retailers.

#Entry of organized retail is transforming the logistics industry. This will create significant positive externalities across the economy.

#Small manufacturers did not report any significant impact of organized retail.

Policy Recommendations

On the basis of the results of the surveys and the review of international retail experience, the study makes the following major recommendations:

1. Modernization of wetmarkets through public-private partnerships.

2. Facilitate cash-and-carry outlets, like Metro, for sale to unorganized retail and procurement from farmers, as in China.

3. Encourage co-operatives and associations of unorganized retailers for direct procurement from suppliers and farmers.

4. Ensure better credit availability to unorganized retailers from banks and micro-credit institutions through innovative banking solutions.

5. Facilitate the formation of farmers' co-operatives to directly sell to organized retailers.

6. Encourage formulation of "private codes of conduct" by organized retail for dealing with small suppliers. These may then be incorporated into enforceable legislation.

7. Simplification of the licensing and permit regime for organized retail and move towards a nationwide uniform licensing regime in the states to facilitate modern retail.

8. Strengthening the Competition Commission's role for enforcing rules against collusion and predatory pricing.

9. Modernization of APMC markets as modelled on the National Dairy Development Board (NDDB) Safal market in Bangalore.